

Report

**The Security Route to Cooperation:
A New Blueprint for
Pakistan – India Relations**

December 23, 2011



**THE INSTITUTE OF STRATEGIC STUDIES,
ISLAMABAD**

The Security Route to Cooperation: A New Blueprint for Pakistan-India Relations

The Institute of Strategic Studies, Islamabad (ISSI) organised a public talk under its Distinguished Lecture Series on *“The Security Route to Cooperation: A New Blueprint for Pakistan-India Relations”* on December 23, 2011. The speaker, Dr Shireen M. Mazari, in addition to being a prominent political personality, scholar and analyst, is also former Director General ISSI. In his welcome remarks, Director General ISSI, Ambassador (Retd) Ashraf Jehangir Qazi, highlighted the importance of the topic and said that maintaining good relations with India is in the vital interest of Pakistan. Although Pakistan is going through difficult times and is faced with multiple problems, this particular problem continues to need special attention.

Speaking at the occasion, Dr. Mazari said that the Pakistan-India peace process continues to be stalled despite growing recognition that peace and regional cooperation are in the long term interest of the people of the region. Track Two dialogues continue to focus on people-to-people contacts as a means to moving forward but unfortunately, real conflicts that exist between Pakistan and India cannot be resolved simply through this methodology. Media initiatives such as ‘Aman Ki Asha’ reach out to people across borders but do not offer substantive solutions to the real conflicts.

She said that many foreign analysts cite the EU model for Pakistan and India but there is a need to understand the origins of the EU in order to proceed in similar fashion. The underlying message from that model is that for effective and long-term peace and cooperation, Pakistan and India will have to move forward first on the sensitive security and contentious issues.

She also spoke about the model of the Good Friday Agreement between the British and Irish governments, and between them and eight political parties. With the help of these two models, the speaker put forward her recommendations to the Security Route to Cooperation between Pakistan and India. She said that there has to be a breaking of the logjam on Kashmir. The indigenous nature of the struggle in Kashmir cannot be denied. In this regard, she also mentioned a conference that was held in New Delhi where some political parties along with some NGOs for the first time supported the Kashmiris right to self determination. Dr. Mazari further pointed out that in the context of Kashmir, the Good Friday Agreement becomes very relevant as it recognises the right of the people to choose their own future through a referendum. The binding clause is for both states involved to not only accept the result of such a referendum but also allow the people the choice of periodic referendums in case they change their minds.

Dr. Mazari further proposed CBMs in the sensitive security issues areas especially those in the nuclear field. She viewed joint nuclear power generation between Pakistan and India as one of the most important routes to security cooperation as both the countries are overt nuclear powers and are energy deficient. She also made a strong pitch for some

kind of an agreement on nuclear restraint and also called for the list of nuclear facilities that both countries exchange at the end of every year to be expanded.

The presentation was followed by a vibrant question and answer session where a number of guests raised issues that plague the relationship between these two neighbours. One member of the audience expressed his desire to know the views of the speaker on three issues i.e. the four point formula presented by former President Gen. Pervaiz Musharraf on Kashmir, the Indian proposal of hydel power generation sharing between India and Pakistan, and finally the status of the proposed No War Pact between the two countries. Another guest raised the issue of “Third Option” in the resolution of the Kashmir issue. It was also said that the security route to improve the relations between India and Pakistan has been pursued for 60 years and has ended nowhere. Therefore, perhaps it would be advisable for both the countries to take social welfare route.

Dr. Mazari replied that she did not endorse President Musharraf’s four point formula. In her opinion, the formula was unthought-of and the Foreign Office faced difficulties in rationalising it. She insisted that Pakistan has not presented any fresh idea to resolve the Kashmir issue and some work should be done to put forward new ideas based on “Good Friday Agreement”. She said that if Kashmiris want to opt for the third option, Pakistan should not in any way resist that. No one knows what they actually want because no one has given them an opportunity to speak but one thing is confirmed that they do not wish to remain with India. On the issue of “No War Pact” between India and Pakistan, she said that it was a political move

by late President Gen. Zia-ul-Haque but since then, nothing has been heard of it. Conventional war is no more an option but low intensity conflict could be the mode of conflict in future. She said that latest initiatives like “Aman Ki Asha” proves that social welfare route would not yield any results unless sensitive issues are properly dealt. Moreover, the proposal of joint hydel power generation cannot be realistic unless India abides by the rules of Indus Water Treaty.

A comment was made from the audience that Pakistan does not have separate nuclear power reactors and will have to separate its military and civilian nuclear reactors before making any move towards joint civil nuclear generation with India. The guest further added that India could not cooperate with Nepal and Bhutan, both of which are client states in hydel power generation. How then can Pakistan expect Indian cooperation in this regard? Another guest mentioned that India was very excited by the four point formula presented by President Musharraf. Was it a deliberate act on the part of former President to put forward ideas that suited India? Dr. Mazari disagreed with this notion and said that probably the formula was not properly thought of. She said that even if Pakistan has to separate its civil and military nuclear reactors it should be done without any hesitation.

A question was raised regarding the prospects of cooperation on non-traditional security issues. Dr. Mazari responded that some efforts were made to cooperate on non-traditional security issues like terrorism but unfortunately, that initiative has also not worked.

A comment was also made that if Pakistan decides to enter into negotiations to settle the Kashmir issue, it would be doing so from a

position of weakness. Pakistan must put its own house in order before going to the negotiating table and in the meanwhile, keep the issue alive by using diplomatic means. Dr. Mazari in response said that the world is not going to wait for Pakistan to get out of this crisis. If Pakistan comes up with some fresh ideas, it would show productive diplomacy and improve Pakistan's image in the world community.

Finally, a question was asked regarding the relevance of "Simla Agreement" in the context of UN Resolutions to which Dr. Mazari replied that the agreement was violated by India itself when it made incursions in the Pakistani territory in 1984.

Concluding the talk, Ambassador Qazi, Director General ISSI, thanked Dr. Mazari for presenting her views and recommendations, which provided much food for thought. He said that the India-Pakistan relationship would always be fragile. For Pakistan, it has become imperative to make such an environment where it can negotiate with India without compromising on its principled stands. He once again thanked Dr. Mazari and the audience for making the event a success.

*Prepared by: Mahwish Hafeez
Research Fellow, South Asia*