

Report

“4th Pakistan Security Workshop”

October 24, 2013



**THE INSTITUTE OF STRATEGIC STUDIES,
ISLAMABAD**

“4th Pakistan Security Workshop”

The Institute of Strategic Studies, Islamabad (ISSI) in collaboration with Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, and Stimson Centre, Washington DC, U.S. organised the “4th Pakistan Security Workshop” on 24 October, 2013 at Islamabad. The workshop was led by eminent security and international relations experts which included; Dr. Rasul Bakhsh Rais, Director General, ISSI; Ms. Sherry Rehman, Executive President, Jinnah Institute; Dr. Syed Riffat Hussain, Faculty Member, National University of Science and Technology (NUST), Islamabad; Dr. Ashfaq Hasan Khan, Professor, NUST, Islamabad; Mr. George Perkovich, Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, Washington DC, U.S. and Brig. Feroz Hassan Khan, Lecturer, Naval Post Graduate School, Monterey, US. The participants of workshop included a large number of emerging young scholars from collaborating institutes; from various think tanks; universities and official organisations; lawyers and businessmen from across Pakistan. These organisations included; Pakistan Planning Commission, Islamabad; Strategic Plan Division (SPD); Pakistan Nuclear regulatory Authority (PNRA); the Institute of Regional Studies (IRS), Islamabad; Centre for International Strategic Studies (CISS), Islamabad; University of Balochistan, Quetta; Sargodha University; University of Karachi and Bahria University, Islamabad.

The main agenda of the workshop was to critically examine current and future challenges to Pakistan’s security, stability and progress. Pakistan’s vital relationship with major international powers and with its neighbouring states was also a key theme to generate fresh ideas to achieve peace and progress in Pakistan. The workshop was divided into five sessions, based on wide ranging challenges being faced by the country, and these sessions were chaired/moderated by distinguished experts.

The first session on “U.S. Role in the Region,” was chaired/moderated by Dr. Syed Riffat Hussain. Dr. Riffat identified broad U.S. interests in the region and said that the U.S. will maintain its presence in the region even after 2014 withdrawal policy. To initiate the debate, he raised following questions;

- What should the U.S. role in the region be post-2014?
- How might the U.S. reconcile its multiple interests in the region?
- What kind of U.S. assistance has been / will be most helpful (post-2014)?
- Does the U.S. government shutdown impact perception of the future U.S. role in the region?
- What is the right balance between security and civil issues in the U.S.-Pakistan relationship?
- How could Washington maintain positive relations with both India and Pakistan?

These questions initiated a very active analytical debate among participants. A large number of participants highlighted the impact of ongoing terrorism in the country and sought a broader US role to help Pakistan to fight terrorism. During the debate questions were also raised by young participants on the role of Pakistan’s government anti-terrorism policy and the issue of dialogue with Taliban. There were mixed responses on this current dialogue policy of government. Some favoured that the dialogue process should be started from a position of strength by the government while others believed that the terrorism should be rooted out through use of force, as past peace deals were failed to control terrorism. However, there was a general consensus among participants to end this threat of terrorism with all available policy

“4th Pakistan Security Workshop”

options including a dialogue with neighbouring countries. A potential impact of post-2014 US presence and absence in Afghanistan was also assessed in this session.

The second session on “Energy and Economy” was chaired/moderated by Dr. Ashfaq Hasan Khan. Dr. Ashfaq gave a critical analysis of various governmental energy plans and policies. He identified key reasons of current ongoing energy crisis in the country. In order to address the energy and economy security issues, he raised following questions for debate;

- What are the most significant internal and external constraints on energy development in the region? On economic growth?
- How should Pakistan, with or without international involvement, address these constraints?
- What role could external actors play in improving energy and economic concerns?
- What can be reasonably expected on nuclear assistance from states other than China? Where does nuclear power fit into the future national energy mix?

Technical and economic constraints to achieve energy security were highlighted in this session. Pakistan’s weak economic growth was identified as a potential hurdle to achieve future energy security. A broader economic and energy related cooperation was sought from the regional and international players. Impacts of terrorism on weakening Pakistan’s economy were also discussed in this session.

The third session on “Future Discourse of Pakistan” was chaired/moderated by Ms. Shery Rehman. She critically evaluated on going security situation in the country and highlights that terrorism and extremism are major threats to country. These challenges are threatening peace and stability and economic progress. She said that a proactive approach is required to deal with these current challenges. Different countries in the world have contained their problems and have moved on to progress and development, but Pakistan is still stuck there. She demanded for a dedicated anti-terrorism and anti-extremism policy to deal with this threat of terrorism. She highlighted that in post-2014 situation a weak Afghanistan will bring a wide ranging challenges of security and stability for Pakistan. On a question related to dialogue with Taliban, she replied that talks with terrorist will yield no result. However, many workshop participants believed that political leadership should be given a chance to curb this menace of terrorism. They were of the view that at least something should be started to reduce and eventually eliminate such threats of terrorism and extremism in the country.

The Fourth Session on “Beyond Cold Start and ‘Hot End’” was chaired/moderator by Brig. Feroz Hassan Khan. He highlighted different aspects of nuclear deterrence between India and Pakistan and discussed different policy options to avert any nuclear crisis between both countries. To initiate the debate, he raised following questions;

- What factors, internal and external to both India and Pakistan, pose the greatest challenge to deterrence stability in South Asia?
- At what point would additional nuclear capabilities (or delivery systems) no longer improve Pakistan’s security?
- Do tactical nuclear weapons/short-range systems improve deterrence stability in South Asia?

“4th Pakistan Security Workshop”

- What steps could India and/or Pakistan take to limit the risk of non-state actors’ sparking inter-state conflict that could lead to conflict escalation?
- What nuclear posture should Pakistan employ? Is there meaningful debate on this question?

Brig. Feroz generated many hypothetical crisis scenarios between Indian and Pakistan and asked participants to respond with available policy responses. Participants actively responded to these scenarios and felt the need to enhance confidence building policies between two nuclear rivals to avert any nuclear disaster. Among other problems, Terrorism, conventional asymmetries, geographical proximity, and accidental use of nuclear weapons were highlighted as potential sources for breakdown of nuclear deterrence between both states. This session generated a real debate on how to strengthen the notion of deterrence between India and Pakistan and what step can be taken to avert any future failure of deterrence between both countries.

The final and fifth session on “Pakistan-India Path Forward,” was chaired/moderated by Mr. George Perkovich. He elaborated the main theme of how to normalise India-Pakistan relations and to achieve peace and progress in South Asian. Following questions were identified to analyse future path of India and Pakistan;

- How would you craft a strategy to move forward? What issues should India and Pakistan prioritize in bilateral relations? Is there room for a mix of incremental steps and symbolic leaps?
- What are the linkages between security, economy, and energy in South Asia?
- What are meaningful CBMs that could be undertaken to improve India-Pakistan relations (in the areas of economy/trade, energy, and security)?
- What advice would you give policymakers in Pakistan? In India, China, and the United States?

Responding to these questions, a large number of participants identified that robust strategies are required to deal with the challenges of terrorism, energy security and lack of economic development. In order to bring peace and progress in Pakistan, a cooperative and friendly relation with other key international players and neighbouring states is also need of the time. Overall this workshop generated awareness among emerging young scholars with an objective to deal with these challenges and to take Pakistan on a path towards peace, stability and prosperity.

- *Prepared by*

Malik Qasim Mustafa
Research Fellow

“4th Pakistan Security Workshop”

List of Participants of 4th Pakistan Security Workshop

No.	Name	Affiliation
1.	Dr. Rasul Bakhsh Rais	The Institute of Strategic Studies, Islamabad (ISSI)
2.	Ms. Sherry Rehman	Jinnah Institute, Islamabad
3.	Ms. Julia Thompson	Stimson Centre, Washington DC, U.S.
4.	Mr. George Perkovich	Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, Washington DC, U.S.
5.	Mr. Toby Dalton	Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, Washington DC, U.S.
6.	Brig. Feroz H. Khan	Naval Post Graduate School, Monterey, CA, US
7.	Dr. Rifaat Hussain	National University of Science and Technology (NUST), Islamabad
8.	Dr. Ashfaue H. Khan	National University of Science and Technology (NUST), Islamabad
9.	Mr. Hussain Nadim	Pakistan Planning Commission, Islamabad
10.	Ms. Faiza Mir	University of Balochistan, Quetta
11.	Mr. Imran Abbas	Sargodha University, Sargodha
12.	Mr. M. Salman	University of Karachi, Karachi
13.	Mr. Zeeshan Adhi	Lawyer/ Lecturer, Karachi
14.	Ms. Haleema Saadia	Arms Control Disarmament, Strategic Plan Division (SPD)
15.	Ms. Ghazala Jalil	The Institute of Strategic Studies, Islamabad (ISSI)
16.	Ms. Sumeta A. Syed	Member of Sindh Provincial Assembly
17.	Mr. Shamroze Khan	Businessmen, Karachi
18.	Ms. Sana Anis	University of Karachi, Karachi
19.	Ms. Aarish Khan	The Institute of regional Studies, Islamabad
20.	Mr. Salman Ali Bettani	Bahria University, Islamabad
21.	Ms. Farzana Siddique	Centre for International Strategic Studies, Islamabad
22.	Mr. Malik Qasim Mustafa	The Institute of Strategic Studies, Islamabad (ISSI)
23.	Ms. Sitara Noor	Pakistan Nuclear Regulatory Authority (PNRA)
24.	Ms. Salma Malik	DSS, Quaid-i-Azam University (QAU), Islamabad
25.	Ms. Sadia Tasleem	DSS, Quaid-i-Azam University (QAU), Islamabad